



UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
Washington, D.C. 20460

OFFICE OF
GENERAL COUNSEL

MEMORANDUM

SUBJECT: Limited Waiver from Section 1, Paragraph 2 of Executive Order 13989

FROM: James Payne **JAMES PAYNE**
Deputy General Counsel for Environmental Media and Regional Law Offices,
and Designated Agency Ethics Official

TO: Marianne Engelman-Lado
Deputy General Counsel for Environmental Initiatives

Digitally signed by JAMES
PAYNE
Date: 2021.04.14
13:21:48 -04'00'

Pursuant to the authority delegated under Section 3 of Executive Order 13989 (January 20, 2021), and after consultation with the Counsel to the President, I hereby grant you a limited waiver from the requirements of Section 1, paragraph 2 of the Executive Order. I certify that this limited waiver is necessary and in the public interest to permit you to participate in certain particular matters in which your former client, the National Resources Defense Council (NRDC), is a party or represents a party, provided that you did not previously participate personally and substantially in the matter with NRDC or any other party.

BACKGROUND

On January 20, 2021, President Biden signed Executive Order 13989, “Ethics Commitments by Executive Branch Personnel,” which includes an Ethics Pledge. The Ethics Pledge imposes ethics requirements beyond federal ethics laws and regulations and attorney bar obligations. All individuals appointed to political positions on or after January 20, 2021 are required to sign the Ethics Pledge, which sets forth the “former client”¹ restriction at Section 1, paragraph 2:

I will not for a period of 2 years from the date of my appointment participate in any particular matter involving specific parties that is directly and substantially related to my former employer or former clients, including regulations and contracts.

You entered federal service at EPA effective January 31, 2021 and received your initial

¹ A “former client” is defined as “any person for whom the appointee served personally as agent, attorney, or consultant within the 2 years prior to the date of his or her appointment, but excluding instances where the service provided was limited to speeches or similar appearances. It does not include clients of the appointee’s former employer to whom the appointee did not personally provide services.” Executive Order 13989, Section 2(l).

ethics training on February 4, 2021, the same day you signed the Ethics Pledge. You have properly recused yourself from participating in any particular matter in which your former employers or any of your former clients is a party or represents a party. The EPA has identified, however, an interest in having you work on particular matters involving one of your former clients – namely, NRDC -- for which you will require a pledge waiver as set forth in Section 3 of Executive Order 13989. Such waivers from the restrictions contained in Section 1, paragraph 2 may be granted upon certification either that the literal application of the restriction is inconsistent with the purpose of the restriction or that it is in the public interest to grant the waiver. With the approval of the White House, the Acting Director of the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) has delegated to each executive branch Designated Agency Ethics Official the authority to exercise Section 3 waiver authority after consultation with the Counsel to the President.²

ANALYSIS

Your career has been devoted to civil rights and environmental justice. Prior to joining the Biden Administration, you directed an Environmental Justice (EJ) Clinic at Vermont Law School that trains students in community lawyering and civil rights enforcement in the environmental justice context, and also served as Lecturer at both the Yale University School of Public Health and the Yale School of the Environment, where you supervised interdisciplinary teams of law, environmental, and public health students working on climate justice issues.

Your experience also includes ten years as General Counsel at New York Lawyers for the Public Interest (NYLPI), a non-profit civil rights law firm, where you directed a legal and advocacy program addressing racial and ethnic disparities in access to health care, environmental justice, and disability rights. You began your legal career as a staff attorney at the NAACP Legal Defense and Educational Fund, Inc. (LDF), where you represented clients attempting to break barriers of access to health care and quality education. You recently served as co-chair of the Equity and Environmental Justice Working Group of Connecticut's Governor's Council on Climate Change, and as a board member of both WE ACT for Environmental Justice and the Center for Public Representation. You have lectured widely and taught graduate, law, and undergraduate level courses. You also hold a B.A. in government from Cornell University, a J.D. from the University of California at Berkeley, and an M.A. in Politics from Princeton University.

PREVIOUS INVOLVEMENT IN FOIA CASES WITH NRDC

During the two-year period prior to your federal appointment, on behalf of the EJ Clinic you directed (first at Yale University and then at Vermont Law School), you and co-counsel Southern Environmental Law Center submitted requests for certain EPA records pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA). These FOIA requests were made on behalf of three client groups that included NRDC. This limited waiver applies only to NRDC.

² See Office of Government Ethics Legal Advisory, LA-21-04 (Feb. 18, 2021).

The requests asked for information related to EPA's Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 (Title VI) docket, including complaints, acknowledgments, jurisdictional decisions, referrals and any dispositive decisions. Upon release of EPA's responsive records, the student team under your supervision reviewed the documents and discussed legal options in consultation with co-counsel and at the direction of the clients. Approximately four FOIA requests were submitted on behalf of these client groups, the first of which was in 2017 while you were at Yale University. You received no compensation specifically for this FOIA-related work that was distinct from your salary provided by your employers for running and supervising a clinic and serving as faculty. Although there were follow-up conversations with employees in EPA's External Civil Rights and Compliance Office (ECRCO) within the Office of General Counsel (OGC), they were limited to the FOIA response. There have been no legal challenges, appeals or litigation related to these FOIA requests.

YOUR OFFICIAL DUTIES ON BEHALF OF EPA

OGC serves as the chief legal advisor to the EPA Administrator and implements the nation's environmental laws. OGC also provides legal counsel to EPA policymakers and represents the Agency in court challenges to agency actions. In your position as Deputy General Counsel for Environmental Initiatives, you have responsibilities within OGC for the External Civil Rights Compliance Office, the Civil Rights and Finance Law Office, and the Pesticides and Toxic Substances Law Office (PTSLO). PTSLO is responsible for legal issues and related litigation for the Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention (OCSPP) in connection with OCSPP's regulatory efforts addressing pesticides and toxic chemicals governed respectively by the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act (FIFRA) and the Toxic Substances Control Act (TSCA). Similarly, PTSLO also provides legal support for OCSPP related to the Pollution Prevention Act (PPA) and the Toxics Release Inventory (TRI), the program under the Emergency Planning and Community Right-To-Know Act (EPCRA) that informs citizens about toxic releases in their communities. NRDC is frequently involved in these regulatory areas and is often named as a party to the litigation that PTSLO addresses.

In the position of Deputy General Counsel for Environmental Initiatives, your participation in the review and direction of substantive environmental legal matters under FIFRA, TSCA, and TRI is critical to PTSLO's effectiveness in these areas. Although EPA currently has two other political appointees in OGC, both have their own bar and pledge obligations to observe with respect to matters arising in PTSLO. Consequently, there is an overlap of recusals that is impinging the ability of OGC to interact with our political leadership in certain nationally significant issues related to public health and the environment that are important priorities of the Administration. With respect to the other OGC political appointees, one is recused because NRDC is her "former employer" for purposes of Executive Order 13989, while the other appointee is recused given prior involvement as an employee in a State government. Your restriction is due solely to prior service in discrete and limited situations that are unrelated to FIFRA, TSCA and TRI.

For the two years prior to your EPA appointment, the services you personally provided to NRDC were limited to those Title VI-related FOIA requests. You did not provide advice or counsel to NRDC or otherwise enter into an attorney-client relationship with them and received

no compensation from them. The nature of your previous affiliation with NRDC does not relate in any way to their involvement in non-Title VI matters, such as OCSPP litigation or regulatory actions, arising at EPA. During the time period relevant to Section 1, paragraph 2 of the Ethics Pledge, you had no involvement on behalf of NRDC with the types of litigation PTSLO handles.

CONCLUSION

In your position as the Deputy General Counsel for Environmental Initiatives, you must be able to advise senior leadership, including the Administrator, and provide legal counsel and vital input into the Agency's programs and litigations that address pesticides and toxic chemicals. Your prior involvements with NRDC was limited in scope and focused only on a handful of FOIA requests.

For the reasons set forth above, I grant you a limited waiver of the provisions of Section 1, paragraph 2 of Executive Order 13989 to enable you to effectively carry out your duties as Deputy General Counsel of Environmental Initiatives; to ably advise senior leadership, including the Acting General Counsel, and the Administrator; and to advance the interests of the Agency. The services you provided to NRDC, during the two years prior to your federal appointment were limited to discrete Title VI FOIA requests. I have determined that it is in the public interest for you to participate in certain specific party matters involving this former client due to your critical role and responsibilities associated with PTSLO. I find that the nature of your previous Title VI work should not restrict your ability to provide your legal counsel, vital input, and toxics expertise on litigation related to the Agency's pesticides and toxic chemicals program.

This limited waiver encompasses any such specific party matters arising at EPA where NRDC is a party or represents a party, and you did not previously participate personally and substantially while serving as an attorney for them or any other party. You are allowed to participate in those specific party matters, including meetings or communications relating to your official duties, where NRDC is present. However, you will remain recused from those specific party matters, including Title VI matters and FOIA requests, in which your former client is a party or if you participated personally and substantially previously. This limited waiver does not otherwise affect your obligations to comply with all other applicable federal ethics laws and regulations and provisions of Executive Order 13989, as well as your own attorney bar obligations.

cc: Dana Remus, Counsel to the President